

Appendix 1

Evaluation of Historical Documents

Under Section 32 of the Highways Act 1980, any court or tribunal determining the existence of public highway rights is required to take all evidence tendered into consideration before determining whether a way has or has not been dedicated as a highway, giving such weight to each document as it considers is *“justified by the circumstances, including the antiquity of the tendered document, the status of the person by whom and the purpose for which it was made or compiled, and the custody in which it has been kept and from which it was produced.”*

The Planning Inspectorate’s Definitive Map Orders Consistency Guidelines have the following to say on the analysis of evidence:

“There is a distinct and important difference between the ‘cumulative’ and ‘synergistic’ approach to the weighing of evidence. Under the cumulative approach a number of relatively lightweight pieces of evidence (e.g. three commercial maps by different cartographers, all produced within the same decade or so) could be regarded as mere repetition. Thus, their cumulative evidential weight may not be significantly more than that accorded to a single map. If, however, there is synergy between relatively lightweight pieces of highway status evidence (e.g. an OS map, a commercial map and a Tithe map), then this synergy (co-ordination as distinct from repetition) would significantly increase the collective impact of those documents. The concept of synergism may not always apply, but it should always be borne in mind. “

Early Commercial maps

A number of map-makers (such as Isaac Taylor, Thomas Milne and C & J Greenwood) were producing small-scale maps (often one inch to the mile or less) during the 17th – 19th centuries. These were often sponsored by local landowners, and purchased as works of art rather than aids to navigation. The quality of surveying varied, and prior to 1800 was generally poor compared with similar scale Ordnance Survey maps produced from 1808 onwards. Although in isolation they do not prove the status of the roads and tracks shown on them, when considered alongside other evidence they can be helpful in identifying the status, location, and early origin of a route.

Estate Maps and surveys

Prepared by landowners for their own estate management purposes, estate maps and surveys carry less evidential weight than maps which were prepared under statutory authority or subject to public scrutiny. However, they can be useful as they often contain more detail than other maps and have the advantage of having been prepared by, or for, people with an intimate knowledge of the land in question. They were frequently made immediately before, or after, a land transaction, such as a sale or enclosure.

Inclosure Maps and Awards

Inclosure is the name given to the process whereby land was taken out of a communal, or common farming system, and allotted to individuals who subsequently retained sole ownership of their individual parts of it. It had a

major impact on the landscape, as large open fields previously cultivated in strips or blocks were divided by hedges into separate units, and waste or common land was similarly fenced or hedged and improved by its new owners. During this process account had to be taken of the public roads and other highways crossing the land being inclosed. As a consequence, Inclosure evidence is one of the few historic sources that can provide conclusive evidence of the status and location of highways.

From the mid 18th century, most inclosures took place with the approval of Parliament, under the authority of commissioners, or latterly a Valuer, who could vary the existing highway network and set out new or additional highways, within the parameters of their statutory powers. The process was refined during the nineteenth century, with two general acts (1836 and 1845) bringing together the most commonly used clauses and applying these to each local act (unless otherwise stated).

Documents evidencing informal inclosure agreements between landowners also survive. These do not have parliamentary authority and any changes to the highway network brought about by such agreements do not have legal force in the same way as changes made by Inclosure Commissioners appointed by Parliament. The documents can, nevertheless, be good evidence of the reputation of highways or the intention of landowners to dedicate paths for public use.

Tithe maps and awards

The Tithe Commutation Act 1836 completed a process that had been going on piecemeal for some years, and required the payment of tithe (i.e. local taxes payable (usually) to the church or its representative) to be converted from a percentage of the produce of land, to a money payment, in order to calculate and record the titheable value of land detailed maps were drawn up for each parish. These are valuable pictures of land use and ownership at the relevant time (usually between 1838 and 1845). The way in which roads and tracks are recorded on the map and in the award can be helpful in determining their status (public roads, were often untitheable, because they did not have a value for agriculture and might be recorded in the 'Roads and Waste' section of the award). These maps have a high evidential value, because they were part of a statutory process which was open to public scrutiny. However, they were not prepared with a view to recording the existence or status of public highways and, in the past, their significance for rights of way has been overstated. It is impossible to apply a general set of interpretative rules for all tithe maps: different maps treat public highways in different ways and each must be studied and evaluated individually if any reliable conclusion is to be drawn from them.

Railway and Canal Plans

Plans of the intended routes of railways (and, more rarely, canals) were deposited before Parliament at the same time as bills seeking authorisation for their construction. Plans and accompanying books of reference detailing the proposed line were required to provide details of the land to be crossed, including existing public highways. The process was open to public scrutiny and formed the basis of compulsory purchase and compensation payments. In consequence, they are normally regarded as good evidence of the status of highways crossed by the proposed lines. Not all of the railways and canals were

built and so many more plans survive than routes were eventually constructed. There are sometimes inconsistencies between different plans which must cast some doubt on their reliability, but in general these are seen as a good source of evidence for the existence and status of public highways.

Quarter Sessions and Petty Sessions Records

The Court of Quarter Sessions, and Magistrates (acting either independently or in Petty Sessions) used to carry out many administrative functions, including the maintenance and protection of highways. Minutes of proceedings, or papers lodged with either Sessions (although in Hampshire far fewer records survive for the business of the Petty Sessions or Magistrates than for the higher court) can provide strong evidence of the existence and status of highways. Stopping up and diversion orders made by the Quarter Sessions have the legal effect stated in the order in the same way as orders made by the County Council and Magistrates now do.

Ordnance Survey Maps and records

The first maps of Hampshire produced by the Ordnance Survey and commercially available date from the early 19th century and were a great improvement on contemporary maps of a similar genre. The most useful series of maps are the 1:2,500 County Series maps, produced at intervals between the late 1860s and the 1940s. These maps provide an accurate picture of the landscape at the date of survey, and carry strong evidential weight, but it should always be borne in mind that the surveyors mapped physical features and not legal rights. These maps cannot be taken in isolation as evidence of the legal status of the paths and tracks shown on them.

Additional help in determining the status of a path can be found in other Ordnance Survey Records: the first edition County Series Map was accompanied by a Book of Reference, which identified 'Roads' (and sometimes even 'Public Roads' or 'Occupation Roads'); the object name books (some have survived for the third edition, circa 1909) relied on local knowledge (for example, the Overseer of Highways) to describe features, including public roads; boundary books can record public highways where they also form parish boundaries and levelling records may also refer to roads and other features.

Finance Act Maps

The Finance Act 1909/10 imposed a land tax which necessitated giving a value to every landholding in the country. The value of a landholding was reduced if it was affected by a right of way. The maps and records can therefore, be used to identify rights of way where these crossed taxable land and on account of which the owner claimed a reduction in value. Land in the ownership of an authority entitled to levy a rate (such as a highway authority) was exempt from the tax and so roads and tracks shown on the maps to be excluded from a taxable landholding might be expected to be public vehicular highways (sometimes referred to as 'white roads' on account of their not being shaded in the same way as taxable hereditaments). The existence of routes of a lesser status (footpaths or bridleways) running through taxable land may be inferred by reference to the accompanying field books, which may record a deduction in respect of a right of way.

Documents and plans produced under the Finance Act can provide good evidence regarding the existence and/or status of a way, but it should be borne in mind that information relating to public highways was incidental to the main purpose of the legislation.

Highway Minutes

Minutes of the Turnpike Trusts, the local Vestry, Highway Boards, and Parish and District Councils can provide valuable evidence of the existence and status of highways and their management and these records have strong evidential weight.

Maintenance Maps (the 1929 'Handover' Map)

These maps were prepared by the Surveyor of each district within Hampshire when responsibility for the maintenance of rural, unclassified roads was transferred to the County Council (as prescribed in the Local Government Act of 1929). The maps must be given some weight because they are good evidence of what the highway surveyor considered to be publicly maintainable. Having said that, it is not known how rigorous were the inquiries that resulted in the colouring that appears on the maps, and it should also be borne in mind that they were internal documents that were not subject to public scrutiny. Further, the maps were a record of maintenance responsibility, not public rights – a route left uncoloured on the Handover Map may nevertheless have been in public use.

Maintenance maps add weight to a body of evidence where they are consistent with it, but great care needs to be taken before attributing too much importance to them where they contradict earlier evidence of the use and status of a path.

Private conveyancing documents and sales particulars

These might provide useful supporting evidence when considered alongside other documents, but generally carry fairly low evidential weight.